



MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCES OF UKRAINE  
in cooperation with  
NATIONAL ERASMUS+ OFFICE IN UKRAINE  
UKRAINE HIGHER EDUCATION REFORM EXPERTS



SUMMARY

Cluster meeting

Higher Education Capacity Building in Structural Tempus & Erasmus+ Projects: Current Outcomes  
Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, Collegium hall, 10 Peremogy Av., Kyiv  
Thursday, 17 November 2016

Purpose: National scale implementation of the Structural projects' outcomes through their use of Ukrainian Higher Education Institutions, Ministry for Education and Science of Ukraine, the Parliament' Committee on Science and Education, Accreditation Body of Ukraine / National Quality Assurance Agency (NQAA), other stakeholders in the framework of Higher Education reforms.

Objectives: To gather Structural Projects' outcomes into clusters according to content of the planned and achieved projects' results in order to define synergy and supplementary effect of potential impact and present / submit proposals to appropriate stakeholders.

Prepared Recommendations for national level implementation of the projects' outcomes through its exploitation in the frame of the Ministry' and Parliament' working groups on legislative and others changing for support of higher education reforms.

Follow up after 2015: Recommendations for Structural projects were prepared by National Erasmus+ office in Ukraine consisting of two parts: general recommendations and detailed recommendations to each particular project. Recommendations were sent Executive Agency of Education, Audiovisual and Culture, Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, to project contacts and placed on the NEO web-site. The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine become more pro-active in projects, they participated in projects events, placed information on their web-site. The projects reactivated cooperation with the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine; strengthened dissemination of their achievements via national and international conferences/ seminars/ workshops/fairs; publications in thematic journals and NEO/ universities/ projects web-sites. The project representatives are involved into the working groups on different issues on higher education modernization agenda. They cooperate with regional and local communities as well as business on activities to use capacities built by universities within Tempus projects (e.g. IT clusters, third age education, start ups).

Higher Education Reform Experts (HEREs) during their meetings discussed on how to strengthen national impact of the projects outcomes and their contribution the current reforms. HEREs initiated to introduce project curator roles according to their cluster expertise since some HEREs are actively involved into different working groups on reforms at the national level, so they can bring projects outcomes directly during their meetings. After the internal consultations each HERE team member were appointed as a curator to the Structural projects and will follow up and assist them in further promotion and exploitation of the results.

Annual seminar "**Higher Education Capacity Building in Structural Tempus & Erasmus+ Projects: Current Outcomes**" (23 projects, 2010-2019) within **Cluster meeting** format initiated by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine was conducted in cooperation with National Erasmus+ office in Ukraine, Ukraine Higher Education Reform Experts and with support of the Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency (EACEA) and EU Delegation to Ukraine on November 17, 2016 at the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine.

Project teams (45 persons) of Ukraine' higher educational institutions presented the current outcomes of Tempus and Erasmus+ Structural Projects on Higher Education Capacity Building in the context of

European integration and higher education reform for the representatives of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, Support Group to Ukraine, EACEA, EU Delegation to Ukraine, National Erasmus+ office in Ukraine and HEREs as Structural Projects curators (*18 persons*).

The event was attended by Volodymyr KOVTUNETS, the First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine, Vira RYBAK, Sector Manager Education, Science, Information Society, EU Delegation to Ukraine, Giulia MORO, Project Officer for Ukraine, Erasmus+ CBHE Unit, EACEA, Lyudmila TATSENKO, Head of Education, the British Council Ukraine and a representative of the European Commission – Nadiya VERTEBNA, Support Group for Ukraine (SGUA), operating under the implementation of the Association Agreement between the EU and Ukraine.

The *key issues* discussed at the event were the *implementation* of the international projects outcomes at the national level where the obligatory partner is the Ministry, in frame of the reforms in higher education, setting *cooperation* with relevant Departments of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine.

Director of the Higher Education Department Oleg SHAROV, Director of the Attestation of Highly Qualified Personnel and Licensing Department Andriy SHEVTSOV, Deputy Head of the International Cooperation and European Integration Department Liubov SCHITKA, Head of the University Education Unit Alla RYBALKO (project contact persons) and other representatives of the Ministry as well as Deputy Head on International Affairs of National Quality Assurance Agency Sergiy KURBATOV joined the discussion.

During period from Structure Projects Seminar 2015, some project teams have cooperated with the Ministry and achieved progress in project outcomes development and implementation:

- QUAERE (2015-2017), Quality Assurance System in Ukraine: Development on the base of ENQA Standards and Guidelines – project team in cooperation with the Ministry are conducting national survey on QA issues for preparation of *Analytical review and assessment of national HE system in the light of the ESG*;

- QANTUS (2013-2017), Qualifications Frameworks for Environmental Science at Ukrainian Universities – Sectoral Qualifications Framework (SQF) for Environmental Science (for three cycles) and its outcomes were presented and discussed within meeting of the Ministry’ Scientific and Methodical Commission (SMC) for HE standards development in the context of preparation of standard for Ecology; *guide* for SQF development was placed on the project site; proposals for improvement of draft standards for Bachelor and Master levels were send to the SMC and Vadym ZAKHARCHENKO, HERE as national coordinator and NQF developer will present at the SMC the *expertise for draft standards* on November 22, 2016;

- ALIGN (2013-2017), Achieving and checking the alignment between academic programmes and qualification frameworks – *Mechanisms* for HEIs to achieve alignment of academic programmes (Competences and Learning Outcomes) with NQFs were developed, and appropriative modernized programs are under pilot accreditation of EU QAA – project partners, training courses on Learning Outcome assessment in line with NQF are developing;

- INARM (2012-2015), Informatics and Management: Bologna-Style Qualifications Frameworks – Sectoral Qualifications Framework (SQF) and standards for Informatics and Management (for Bachelor and Master cycles) were *presented and discussed within meeting* of the Ministry’ Scientific and Methodical Commission (SMC) for HE standards development;

- LeAGUe (2013-2016), Network for Developing LifeLong Learning in AM, GE, UA – Recommendations for Lifelong Learning (LLL) Strategy were developed and submit to the Ministry; LLL Centers established on base of Universities-partners in Kyiv, Kharkiv, Odessa are operational;

- ELITE (2013-2017), Education for Leadership, Intelligence and Talent Encouraging – Concept for “Universities’ role in Leadership and Organizational Development” developed and presented for stakeholders *incl.* the Ministry; Centers of Leadership were established in Kyiv, Kharkiv, Odessa, selection of school directors (principals) realized by certified experts at the Center of Leadership in Borys Grinchenko

Kyiv University on order of the Kyiv Municipality, assessment of Universities' teams at the Center of Leadership in Institute of Higher Education was realized in frame of University Leadership project in cooperation with the British Council Ukraine;

- INOVEST (2012-2016), Eastern Partnership in Pedagogical Innovations in Inclusive Education – guidance for the development and implementation of professional teachers' training programmes in Pedagogical Innovations in Inclusive Education presented on project web-site, Teacher Training programmes for Pedagogical Innovations in Inclusive Education was implemented within teacher further education system on base of Teacher Training institutes in Odessa and Kyiv, international panel on Pedagogical Innovations in Inclusive Education in cooperation with French experts is planned on November 29, 2016, Kyiv;

- ATHENA (2012-2016), Fostering Sustainable and Autonomous Higher Education Systems in the Eastern Neighbouring Area – Analytical materials (Policy roadmap, guidelines), training kits (7 manuals) on University Autonomy developed and presented on the EUA site, University Autonomy Policy roadmap was discussed in frame of National Rector's Council of Ukraine and submitted to the Ministry;

- INURE (2012-2015), Integrated University Management System: EU Experience on NIS Countries' Ground – Integrated University Management System (IUMS) was implemented within Sumy State University, training courses on IUMS for Universities were developed and now they are realized by the Innovation and Education IT Center on request of Universities, book on Integrated University Management System was prepared by Khmelnynskiy National University, IUMS is under configuring for interfacing with the Ukraine' Uniform State Database of Education;

- EANET (2013-2017), Entrepreneur Alumni Network – Entrepreneur Alumni Networks (EAN) were created and their capacities were built within each University-partner (*incl.* typical procedures and other documents – 8 ones), EAN fundraising mechanism and employment services were developed and their pilot exploitation was implemented;

- IMPRESS (2012-2016), Improving the Efficiency of Student Services – Student Support Service Centres for improvement of graduates' employment as well as for modernization of recruitment process were established (*incl.* Vasyl' Stus Donetsk National University as a relocated *HEI*), roadmap for student self-governance development prepared;

- SpinOff (2012-2015), Support of innovations through improvement of regulatory framework for higher education in Ukraine – *Proposals* on commercialization of innovations were prepared and submitted to the Parliament' Committee on Science and Education in frame of work on drafts of Law On Higher Education (2014) and Law On Research and Scientific and Technical Activities (2015), *Roadmap* for commercialization of innovations for Universities was developed and submitted to the Ministry, *Help-desks* for Knowledge Transfer established in Odessa, Kyyvyi Rig, Dnipro, Ivano-Frankivsk (KT Help-desk acts in cooperation with Horizon 2020 Contact Point at the Ivano-Frankivsk National Technical University of Oil and Gas) provide training for Vice-Rectors on Research;

- FKTBUM (2013-2017), Fostering the Knowledge Triangle in UA, Bel, Mol – Analytical materials and draft implementation plan (roadmap) of activities for integration of higher education, innovation and research were prepared and submitted to the Ministry (Department of Innovative activities and Technology Transfer);

- PICASA (2013-2017), Promoting Internationalization of HEIs in Eastern Neighborhood Countries through Cultural and Structural Adaptations – University guide for internationalization was developed and implemented on institutional level, procedures of quality assurance for University internationalization in frames of learning, teaching and research are under development;

- UNIVIA (2013-2016), Development and improvement of the University Administration on International Affairs – typical guidance for International Relations Office *incl.* Quality Monitoring Division, University internationalization strategy was developed, piloting and review of project outcomes in frames of workshops on internationalization that were provided by British Council Ukraine;

- EICL (2010-2013), E-internationalization for collaborative learning – recommendation for virtual internationalization was submitted to the Ministry.

In 2016 Projects outcomes were distributed into *Clusters* in line with key HE reform areas: *Quality Assurance system development, NQF implementation and study program modernisation, PhD study development, Lifelong Learning, University Governance in context of Autonomy and Student Support, Integration of Higher Education, Innovation and Research, Business (Knowledge Triangle), Higher Education Internationalisation and Mobility*. In addition, projects were assigned to the curators according to expertise areas of HEREs.

Following the discussion, the First Deputy Minister Vladimir KOVTUNETS outlined that the majority of the projects presented actual and in-time outcomes. He proposed to hold soon series of Cluster workshops for specific areas of reform in higher education with project teams involving HEREs, other experts and Ministry' representatives to discuss ways of transforming the Tempus and Erasmus+ projects outcomes into reform actions.

Recommendations for national level implementation of the projects' outcomes were developed according to HE reform Clusters taking into account planned Cluster workshops.

### **1. QUALITY ASSURANCE (QUAERE, TRUST, UNIQTOOL, C3QA, DocHub, QANTUS, ALIGN, INARM)**

1.1. Proposals on practical guidelines (procedures, tools) in line with ESG (*incl.* Student and employers involvement) for internal and external QA systems in cooperation with NQAA (Sergiy KURBATOV, NQAA) and the Ministry (Higher Education Department Oleg SHAROV, Director of the Attestation of Highly Qualified Personnel and Licensing Department Andriy SHEVTSOV) as well as with British Council Ukraine.

1.2. Use Portal TRUST as unified transparent framework for the internal and external QA systems (precondition – examining portal possibilities on the example Ukrainian Catholic University).

1.3. Use UNIQTOOL e-tools system as unified transparent framework for the internal QA systems (precondition – examining system possibilities on the example Kyiv Polytechnic University).

1.4. Training of staff of National Quality Assurance Agency (NQAA), the Ministry and HEIs to use QA procedures and tools.

1.5. Revise Licensing for PhD study in cooperation with the Ministry and NQAA.

1.6. Proposal on accreditation procedures for specialized academic council (for defend PhD dissertation) and PhD programs in cooperation with NQAA and the Ministry.

1.7. Expertise of higher education standards for the Ministry' Scientific and Methodical Council in the context of learning outcomes assessment, alignment with NQF (especially for Management, Ecology).

### **2. THIRD CYCLE / PHD STUDY (QUAERE, C3QA, DocHub)**

2.1. Proposal on improvement of regulatory frameworks for the functioning of inter-institutional cooperation in PhD training (payments for courses, co-supervision of students from non-host HEIs), recognition of transfer credits (both domestic and international) in cooperation with the Ministry (Higher Education Department Oleg SHAROV, Director of the Attestation of Highly Qualified Personnel and Licensing Department Andriy SHEVTSOV).

### **3. QUALIFICATION FRAMEWORK (QANTUS, ALIGN, INARM)**

3.1. Proposals for draft Law On Education (under development by the work group of Parliament Committee on Science and Education) on Sectoral Qualifications Frameworks and National system of qualifications (members of the work group – Higher Education Department Oleg SHAROV, Volodymyr LUGOVYY and Yuriy RASHKEVYCH, HEREs).

3.2. Proposals on Sectoral Qualifications Frameworks development in line with NQF Implementation Plan submitted to the Cabinet.

#### **4. LIFELONG LEARNING and TEACHERS' TRAINING (LeAGUe, ELITE, INOVEST)**

4.1. Proposals for draft Law On Education (under development by the work group of Parliament Committee on Science and Education) on LLL and Teacher Training for Pedagogical Innovations in Inclusive Education (members of the work group – Higher Education Department Oleg SHAROV, Volodymyr LUGOVYY, HERE).

4.2. National system for University management training in the context of Leadership in cooperation with British Council Ukraine (particular for relocated Universities).

**5. UNIVERSITY GOVERNANCE in the context of AUTONOMY, STUDENTS' SUPPORT, KNOWLEDGE TRIANGLE** (Integration of Higher Education, Innovation and Research, Business) (QUAERE, ATHENA, ELITE, INURE, EANET, IMPRESS)

5.1. Self-assessment mechanism as an integral part of university governance and student involvement in university self-assessment processes for accreditation.

5.2. Training for employees of the Ministry, for Rectors and Vice-Rectors on Autonomy tools in cooperation with the Ministry and Institute of higher Education.

5.3. Integrated University Management System could be configure for interfacing with the Ukraine' Uniform State Database of Education in cooperation with the Ministry.

5.4. Concept on funding Alumni *incl.* benefits for business in the context of the Ministry' Concept changing funding higher education system.

#### **6. KNOWLEDGE TRIANGLE (SpinOff, FKTBUM)**

6.1. Improvement of Roadmap for commercialization of innovations for Universities and Roadmap of activities for integration of higher education, innovation and research in line with new legislation in cooperation with the Ministry (Department of Innovative activities and Technology Transfer).

#### **7. INTERNATIONALISATION, MOBILITY (PICASA, UNIVIA, EICL, MILETUS)**

7.1. National Strategy for Higher Education Internationalisation *incl.* e-internationalization and virtual mobility, particularly for students with disabilities.

7.2. Events for International Affairs Offices at the Ministry (International Cooperation and European Integration Department).

All participants highlighted the importance, usefulness and necessity of projects meetings. There was a suggestion to perform Projects in Higher Education Fair with other donors in order to provide platform for promotion and meeting of all projects teams with interested stakeholders and beneficiaries for more effective exploitation of results. Additionally, it will be also valuable to expand the annual meeting of Structural Projects into series of cluster workshops and to involve Joint Projects teams and even other donors projects working on similar clusters to ensure synergies and horizontal cooperation and to cover different levels impact: personal, institutional, community, regional, national.

## GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS TO ALL PROJECTS

1. Annual Round Table “Tempus & Erasmus+ Projects Outcomes Implementation: National and International levels” to be performed in 2017 (responsible – NEO, projects and Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).
2. Cluster meetings of international projects according to key reform priorities and Projects Fair to be performed in 2017 (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, NEO, other donors and projects teams).
3. Facilitate participation of representatives of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and strengthen the role of the Ministry in project implementation, exploitation and dissemination of Tempus & Erasmus+ projects outcomes (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, projects and NEO).
4. To ensure synergy and inter-projects cooperation between projects in higher education funded by different donors, mechanisms to be discussed during next meeting of donors (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).
5. To ensure synergy and inter-projects cooperation between projects within higher education institutions (horizontal cooperation of faculties, departments, chairs etc.) – (responsible – project teams).
6. To perform seminars on Internationalization issues to update on changes in legislation, mechanisms, instruments and to share experience of the projects on internationalization of different donors (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, NEO and other donors).
7. Engage employers to participate in Tempus & Erasmus+ projects development and implementation (responsible – project teams).
8. Involve graduates, students, young researchers into the process of curricula development on competence-based approach within Tempus & Erasmus+ projects development and implementation, which foresees learning outcomes described based on competence of future professional at all level, as well as into the capacity building of departments on research, innovation, career development and employability etc.
9. Materials of Higher Education Reform Experts teams to be used by projects and other higher education universities, involve HERE representatives into peer reviews and seminar, workshops etc. (responsible – project teams, useful materials and translations of key documents of Bologna Process instruments are placed on NEO – HERE web-page at: <http://erasmusplus.org.ua/erasmus/ka3-pidtrymka-reform/natsionalna-komanda-ekspertiv-here/materiali-here.html>).
10. Reinforce the focus on systematic studies on state of play of higher education reforming and analysis of legislation that help to define project idea and risk assessment as well as ensure effective implementation (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, projects and HERE).
11. Perform on regular basis seminars and trainings to higher education institutions on implementation of Bologna instruments: ECTS, ESG, Qualification Frameworks, student-centered learning and teaching, competence-based approach etc. where possible within projects events (responsible – Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, projects and NEO&HERE).
12. Promote to the international educational market Joint curricula for Master and Doctoral (PhD) levels developed within a Tempus projects to engage international students and allowing an individual to receive two or more degrees from partner universities (responsible – relevant project teams and Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).
13. Develop the third higher education cycle – structured PhD programmes based on modern approaches and international experience in the Doctoral School format, using corresponding results of a number of Tempus projects aimed at developing research training and Doctoral Schools (responsible – relevant project teams and Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).
14. Ensure inclusiveness of specific courses for soft/transferable competences development into modernized and created Master and Doctoral (PhD) programmes within Tempus & Erasmus+ projects for the

purpose of graduates' employability enhancement (responsible – relevant project teams and Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).

15. Implement the joint use of the various modern equipment and software purchased within the Tempus project by partner universities (computer classes, video conference halls, special educational research laboratories, libraries, etc) (responsible – higher education and research institutions).
16. Place on the Internet resources both on the websites of the universities participating in the projects and at various information and communication events so that other higher educational institutions could use them in their work (electronic consulting networks, e-libraries, platforms, Internet portals, media centres, distant learning systems, etc) (responsible – project teams at the higher education and research institutions).
17. Promote results of Tempus projects and disseminate information in the Internet space, it is necessary to make the most use of educational Internet resources and the website of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine not only during project implementation but also after that, to ensure sustainability of the project results (responsible – relevant project teams to send the information to the Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, e-mail contact: a\_novosad@mon.gov.ua; l\_schitka@mon.gov.ua).
18. Develop strategic projects with focus on achievement of specific purpose and objectives over 5-7 years using international projects: as an example to enhance social dimension of higher education by expanding courses to different audiences – disadvantaged groups, housewives, newly set enterprises, retired citizens, etc. and to increase multi-disciplinary aspects of programs that are of interest to professionals in the different domains (e.g. e-trading systems are in interest of engineers, economics, IT specialists) – bottom-up approach initiatives come from teams at the higher education and research institutions).
19. To perform training/seminar/workshop for higher education institutions on University Autonomy based on the materials and experience of Tempus IV ATHENA project (responsible – ATHENA and NEO&HERE team in cooperation with Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine).
20. Regular training Universities leadership and faculties on new skills in the context of autonomy: student-centered learning and teaching, ICT, soft skills, R&D, academic writing and foreign language, innovation and commercialization, new management and leadership.