Quality assurance of teaching and learning in emergency and crisis situations

Online technical assistance mission (TAM) for Ukraine

DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning
- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- 11:15-11:50 Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission



DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- 14:45-15:00 Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning
- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission



OBJECTIVES OF THIS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE MISSION

The key objectives of this technical assistance mission are to :

- Provide you with an overview of the key concepts of quality assurance
- Sive you an overview of the **European quality assurance framework**
- Discuss how you can adapt traditional quality assurance tools to the current Ukrainian situation
- Provide you with concrete examples of quality assurance processes of other countries that faced emergency or crisis situations and tried to enhance teaching and learning in higher education



On completion of this session you should be able to:

- Understand the key concepts of quality assurance and their specificities in the European Higher Education Area
- Adapt the key concepts of quality assurance to emergency and crisis situations
- Develop evaluation tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning in emergency and crisis situation
- Develop strategies for improving teaching and learning in higher education institutions facing emergency and crisis situations



INTENDED LEARNING OUTCOMES OF THIS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE MISSION

https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIp QLSfeAH42kpfrx9bv Zpd1QE4vRwajRuGfly 7DNb1fcwcFyeG8Q/viewform?usp=header



DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- 14:45-15:00 Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning
- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission







In your view, what are the key features of a quality education (in a stable country)?

(i) The <u>Slido app</u> must be installed on every computer you're presenting from







In your view, what are the key features of a quality education (in countries in emergency and crisis situations)?

(i) The <u>Slido app</u> must be installed on every computer you're presenting from



WHAT IS QUALITY EDUCATION? – MISONCEPTIONS

Burdensome Rigid Strict Inflexible Compliance-based Disconnected-from-reality

WHAT IS QUALITY EDUCATION? – FROM THEORY...

According to Lee Harvey and Diana Greene, there are five interrelated ways of thinking about quality as...



WHAT IS QUALITY EDUCATION? – FROM THEORY...

"Quality in higher education is a multidimensional, multi-level, and **dynamic concept** that relates to the **contextual** settings of an educational model, to the institutional mission and objectives, as well as to specific standards within a given system, institution, programme, or discipline".

(Vlăsceanu, Grünberg et Pârlea – UNESCO, 2007)



WHAT IS QUALITY EDUCATION?... TO PRACTICE



WHAT IS QUALITY EDUCATION?... TO PRACTICE



WHAT IS QUALITY ASSURANCE? – A GENERAL DEFINITION

"Quality assurance relates to a continuous process of evaluating (assessing, monitoring, guaranteeing, maintaining, and improving) the quality of a higher education system, institutions or programmes. As a regulatory mechanism, quality assurance focuses on both **accountability** and **improvement**, providing information and judgment (not ranking) through an agreed and consistent process and well-established criteria".

(Vlăsceanu, Grünberg et Pârlea – UNESCO, 2007)

Quality Assurance and Accreditation:

A Glossary of Basic Terms and Definitions

compiled by Lazăr VLÄSCEANU, Laura GRÜNBERG, and Dan PÂRLEA

> Bucharest 2007

WHAT IS QUALITY ASSURANCE? – A GENERAL DEFINITION

Internal quality assurance



Quality adjustments

- Immediate change
- Planning and organising change
- for continuous enhancement
- Follow-up

Self-evaluation

- Collecting, processing and analysing relevant data
- Evaluating resources, processes and outcomes against quality standards

External quality assurance

- Public assurance of quality
- Ensures accountability
- Provides recommendationsfor continuous improvement





WHY IS QUALITY ASSURANCE IMPORTANT?

Internal quality assurance (IQA)

- Fosters continuous enhancement and supports strategic planning
- Encourages institutional **autonomy** and responsibility
- Reinforces institutional quality culture
- Helps align teaching and research activities on stakeholders' expectations (students, academic and administrative staff, employers, society...)



External quality assurance (EQA)

- Fosters continuous enhancement based
 on peer reviews
- Ensures **accountability** (especially for public higher education institutions)
- Ensures **transparency** (all evaluation reports are public)
- Promotes **trust** among stakeholders => facilitates student and staff mobility, partnerships and recognition



WHAT TOOLS CAN BE USED FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING?

Plan, do, check, act



It is important to **« close the feedback loop »**! After consulting stakeholders, let them know about te results of the quality assurance process in order to ensure buy-in and understanding

WHAT TOOLS CAN BE USED FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING?

Examples of internal quality assurance tools and procedures higher education institutions usually implement to monitor and enhance their teaching and learning activities

Graduate follow-up surveys	Programme reviews with internal and external stakeholders	Internal evaluation of staff performance	Online platform internal to the institution to share best teaching & learning practices
Job shadowing for young teachers	Regular quality council meetings	Student progression studies	Monitoring various indicators in an inclusive way (take the SDG into account)
Course evaluation by students	Student satisfaction surveys	Teachers mentorship	

WHAT IS QUALITY ASSURANCE? – A EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVE

The Bologna Process is a intergovernmental initiative, distinct from the European Union (although there are collaboration between the European Higher Education Area, that was created with the Bologna Process and the European Commission).

Map of the European Higher Education Area

After the invasion of Ukraine in 2022, it was decided to suspend the rights of representation of the Russian Federation and Belarus in the EHEA.

UKRAINE



Ukraine has been a full member of the Bologna Process / European higher education area since 2005.

WHAT IS QUALITY ASSURANCE? – A EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVE

The initial commitment made within the Bologna Declaration (1999) set out the first intentions related to quality assurance, encouraging the cooperation of European countries in quality assurance of higher education with a view of developing comparable criteria and methodologies.

Milestones

Berlin Communiqué (2003): recognising that 'the primary responsibility for quality assurance in higher education lies with each institution itself'

Bergen Communiqué (2005):

- Ukraine joins the Bologna Process
- Adoption of the 1st edition of the Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area

Yerevan Communiqué (2015): Adoption of the 2nd edition of the ESG



HOW DO THE ESG ASSURE THE QUALITY OF TEACHING AND LEARNING IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS ?



The ESG are based on the following four principles for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area:

- **Higher education institutions have primary responsibility** for the quality of their provision and its assurance
- Quality assurance responds to the **diversity of higher education systems, institutions, programmes and students**
- Quality assurance supports the development of a quality culture
- Quality assurance takes into account the needs and expectations of students, all other stakeholders and society





HOW DO THE ESG ASSURE THE QUALITY OF TEACHING AND LEARNING IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS ?



- 1.1 Policy for quality assurance
- 1.2 Design and approval of programmes
- 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment
- 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification
- 1.5 Teaching staff
- 1.6 Learning resources and student support
- 1.7 Information management
- 1.8 Public information
- 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes
- 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance

Need adaptations to suit emergency and crisis situations

HOW DO THE ESG FOSTER THE LINKS BETWEEN TEACHING, LEARNING AND RESEARCH IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS ?



ESG 2015 C C C C C C C C

Quality assurance policies are most effective when they reflect the relationship between research and learning & teaching

Guideline 1.5.

HEIs provide a supportive environment that "encourages scholarly activity to strengthen the **link between education and research**"



Guideline 1.9

Regular monitoring, review and revision of study programmes "include the **evaluation of the content of the programme in the light of the latest research** in the given discipline thus ensuring that the programme is up to date".



WHY IS THE QUALITY ASSURANCE OF RESEARCH IMPORTANT?

To improve the quality of research

Complement research assessment procedures, take a broader perspective and contribute to enhancing the quality of research

Endorse international and regional efforts regarding the quality of the research environment

To foster the link between learning and teaching and research

Train enlightened students who are able to face the challenges of the 21st century

Develop cross-disciplinary skills, acquire critical thinking skills to improve problem-solving skills, and counter the rise of fake

news

To align with developments in QA of research across the HE sector

56% of HEIs consider education and research as two equally important missions and 11% consider research as more important than education (EUA, 2024)

93% of HEIs cover research in their IQA procedures (EUA, 2023)

Important in war situations to counter the spread of disinformation

EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE OF RESEARCH

⇒ Broad and inclusive definition of research, encompassing all types of research including fundamental, applied, artistic, innovation and knowledge transfer, in line with the continuum defined by the EUA

GG

External quality assurance of research

An all-embracing term that refers to a regular process of reviewing (monitoring, guaranteeing, maintaining, and enhancing) the quality of the **research environment at HEIs**, including its interrelation with the education and societal impact missions of HEIs.

EQA of Research ≠ Research assessment

Research assessment: evaluating research output





Taking stock of the practices of European quality assurance agencies

ENQA WORKING GROUP ON THE QUALITY ASSURANCE OF RESEARCH

MARCH 2025

enga.

HOW DO EUROPEAN QUALITY ASSURANCE AGENCIES VIEW THE EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE OF RESEARCH IN RELATION TO TEACHING & LEARNING?

Aspects of the link between HE and research covered agencies in their EQA of research procedure (N=49)

Research-oriented/informed curricula and research-based teaching... Involvement of researchers in teaching activities PhD/Masters' candidates' achievement and employability data Students' training in research methodologies, integrity and ethics International mobility of students for research activities... Students' and PhD candidates' access to high-quality research... Involvement of PhD candidates in teaching activities Number of students pursuing a career in research, including a...



HOW DOES NAQA VIEW THE EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE OF RESEARCH IN RELATION TO TEACHING & LEARNING?

According to the Law on higher education study programme accreditation is mandatory in Ukraine. NAQA has developed the following criteria for programme accreditation that take into account the external quality assurance of research

- Criterion 1. The design and objectives of the study programme.
- Criterion 2. The structure and content of the study programme.
- Criterion 3. Access to the study programme and learning outcomes recognition.
- Criterion 4. Teaching and learning under the study programme.
 - "Academic staff, researchers (herewith "academics") update their educational content based on the latest scientific achievements and modern practices in the respective sector."
- Criterion 5. Control measures, evaluation of students and academic integrity.
- Criterion 6. Human resources
- Criterion 7. Educational environment and material resources.
- Criterion 8. Internal quality assurance of the study programme.
- Criterion 9. Transparency and publicity.
- Criterion 10. Study through research.

How do you review the link between teaching & learning and research?

How has the war impacted research-based learning?



SWITCHING TO WARTIME QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING

Adopt a **risk-management approach** to quality assurance that places the specific context at its heart.

- ⇒ This approach is seen as more suitable because conflict-affected environments present unique challenges and risks that undermine the delivery of quality teaching and learning.
- ⇒ Risks can be of academic, strategic, financial, operational, reputational, and compliance nature.

⇒ Identifying, classifying, and quantifying these risks is a vital first step to developing mitigation strategies and prioritise the remedial actions to undertake



SWITCHING TO WARTIME QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING

Step 1

Making a diagnosis of the situation with quality assurance mechanisms Step 2

Enhancing the quality of teaching and learning based on quality assurance results Checking on the success of the enhancement policy with quality assurance

Step 3

Any questions or comments?



DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning
- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission


DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- **16:00-16:30** Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- **16:00-16:30** Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

SWITCHING TO WARTIME QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING

Adopt a **risk-management approach** to quality assurance that places the specific context at its heart.

- ⇒ This approach can be seen as more suitable because conflictaffected environments present unique challenges and risks that undermine the delivery of quality teaching and learning.
- ⇒ Risks can be of academic, strategic, financial, operational, reputational, and compliance nature.

⇒ Identifying, classifying, and quantifying these risks is a vital first step to developing mitigation strategies and prioritise the remedial actions to undertake



SWITCHING TO WARTIME QUALITY ASSURANCE OF TEACHING AND LEARNING

Step 1

Making a diagnosis of the situation with quality assurance mechanisms Step 2

Enhancing the quality of teaching and learning based on quality assurance results Checking on the success of the enhancement policy with quality assurance

Step 3

SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



MONITORING STUDENT PROGRESSION IN WARTIME – EXAMPLE FROM SUDAN

Sudan is facing a significant education crisis due to the war, leading to the complete disruption and closure of about 100 public and private universities

 \Rightarrow This situation has resulted in widespread displacement of people and the destruction of higher education institutions

In response to this disorganisation and the fear that a whole generation of students' futures will be lost, a researcher proposes innovating the role of quality assurance systems. The proposed mechanism is the **cohort analysis system**

https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20240911200330425





MONITORING STUDENT PROGRESSION IN WARTIME

Cohort analysis focuses on tracking groups of students who entered a programme in the same academic year over an extended period.

⇒ This longitudinal tracking observes outcomes and trends. Data collected through this system can be used to improve key performance indicators, student satisfaction, and retention rates.

The war has created a "perplexing situation" by **dividing cohorts, such as the 2019 intake, into many clusters. These clusters include students who have:**

- Emigrated to study abroad, covering all costs themselves
- Remained in Sudan, waiting to resume studies
- Continued studies at regional universities in safer areas within Sudan





MONITORING STUDENT PROGRESSION IN WARTIME

The proposed cohort analysis would involve:

- 1) Defining the cohort by their enrolment year (e.g., 2023-24 emigrated students) and programme
- 2) Identifying and comparing course descriptions from their universities in Sudan and the universities abroad.
- 3) Using cluster analysis to identify subgroups within cohorts (e.g., students who emigrated vs. those who relocated within Sudan) and track their studies in different locations. This is needed to decide which programmes align educationally, economically, and culturally with Sudanese university standards.
- 4) Employing sentiment analysis to gather feedback from students who have emigrated over time, correlating their sentiment with performance metrics. This information can be gathered through reviews, surveys, and social media platforms.

MONITORING STUDENT PROGRESSION IN WARTIME

3 main stakeholders involved



This approach is framed as a way to potentially **turn "brain drain" into "brain gain"** by learning from international universities and leveraging the knowledge gained by students abroad Have you managed to monitor student progression in your institution?

What stakeholder should be engaged in monitoring student progression in Ukraine and with what tools?



SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS

Diagnosis: the war has impacted teaching delivery modes making it hard to ensure academic continuity.

 \Rightarrow **Remedial actions**: developing microcredentials

According to UNESCO (2022), a micro-credential:

- Is a record of focused learning achievement verifying what the learner knows, understands or can do.
- Includes assessment based on clearly defined standards and is awarded by a trusted provider.
- Has standalone value and may also contribute to or complement other micro-credentials or macrocredentials, including through recognition of prior learning.
- Meets the standards required by relevant quality assurance.



Retrieved from <u>https://cred4teach.eu/wp-</u> content/uploads/2024/07/Ukraine EN National Framework Micro-Credentials.pdf

DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS – EXAMPLE FROM A WAR SITUATION (BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA)



First forms of microcredentials during the war in Bosnia and Herzegovina (1992-1995):

- Modular learning: the academic year in secondary education was broken into micro-phases depending on security conditions (= block courses and thematic units)
- Shorter academic term (18 weeks instead of 36)
- **Emergency curricula**, integrating university-level exams
- Recognition ensured through links with the University of Sarajevo => students who successfully attended secondary school with microcredentials could enter university, which ensures continuity

Possible advantages of microcredentials in crisis situations today				
Feature		Advantage in crisis		
Modular shor	t courses	Learners can pause/resume based on security		
Online delive	ry	Accessible even in areas with damaged infrastructure		
Stackability & recognition		Builds legally credible qualifications over time		
Support for d professionals	isplaced	Teachers/students retain continuity and employability		

DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS

The development of microcredentials in Ukraine is already under way with several initiatives over the past couple of years...







Webinar "Implementation of Microcredentials as a Response to the Challenges of European Integration and Post-war Recovery: Quality, Recognition, Digitalisation, Inclusion" (27.03.2025, online)

DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS – KEY CONSIDERATIONS FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE AT THE HEIS LEVEL

What are the specific considerations for quality assuring micro-credentials that are originally conceived as part of an existing programme?

Offering individual modules that emerge from existing programmes as separate micro-credentials may be an efficient way for an institution to expand access to the educational offering in a limited time.

However, a course cannot just be split into pieces in order to create microcredentials! Here are some considerations:

1	2	
Assess the relevance	 Define new learning outcomes and adapt the curriculum 	3
of a microcredential	• Do not make assumption on the prior knowledge and skills of the	Ask for learners'
format for a given	learners which may be more diverse than in a regular study	feedback to
course (not all subject	programme	enhance the
are easily turned into a	Define clear credit volume	microcredential
microcredential)	 Test the new format and curriculum with the stakeholders 	

⇒ Align the development of your microcredentials with an institution-wide policy on microcredentials and their quality assurance

DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS – HOW TO QUALITY ASSURE THEM?

Current discussions tend towards an institutional-level approach to the quality assurance of microcredentials, but programme-level approach also have some advantages

Advantages of an institutional-level approach	Advantages of a programme-level approach	
Rely on the institution's internal quality assurance system (even better if it is already externally reviewed)	Agile review, that take into account the specificities of each microcredential	
Less burdensome		
Ensures alignment with the institution's strategy and policies	Account for the variability of quality from one microcredential to another	DUALITY ASSURANCE OF MICRO-CREDENTIALS Expectations within the Context of the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area
Possibility to assess only a		

⇒ In the end, the choice of institutional-level or programme-level approach depends on the national framework and context!

DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS – EXAMPLE FROM A EUROPEAN AGENCY (CATALUNYA)

How does the agency (AQU-Catalunya) define the quality of microcredentials? Let's look at their standards:

- Programme description: university, name of microcredential, EQF level, relationship with the professional family, ECTS, mode of delivery, and offer.
- Justification: relevance of the programme to the labour market and potential of the institution to deliver the programme.
- Aims and learning outcomes (level, relevance according disciplinary field).
- Access, admission, and support of students.
- **Study programme (planning):** structure of the curriculum, coherence between intended learning outcomes, mode of delivery, and teaching and assessment activities.
- **Teaching staff and support staff**: suitability and sufficiency.
- Material resources and services: suitability and sufficiency.
- **Expected results**: academic results, student satisfaction, and employability.





DEVELOPING MICROCREDENTIALS – EXAMPLE FROM A EUROPEAN AGENCY (CATALUNYA)

Following several reviews of microcredentials provided by higher education institutions, AQU-Catalunya identified 2 main challenges to the quality assurance of micro-credentials:

- 1) Adapting criteria and standards initially designed for highly regulated programmes and full-time students to new programmes that focus on employability and on students with completely different profiles.
- 2) The need to devise a more scalable procedure that allows the accreditation of programmes to be undertaken in an aggregated way so as to avoid the external assessment of each programme individually.
- \Rightarrow Push for an **institutional approach** to quality assurance of microcredentials





CONSIDERATION FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE OF E-LEARNING

How to adapt the ESG for e-learning provision?

1.1 Policy for quality assurance

⇒ Institutions should integrate <u>their online teaching strategy</u> into their overall quality assurance policy, actively involving stakeholders.

1.2 Design and approval of programmes

⇒ The design of e-learning programmes should contribute to the creation of an <u>online academic</u> <u>community</u>, ensuring alignment with the institution's mission and involving staff with the necessary expertise.

1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment

⇒ Online programme should involve students and encourage online interaction, use appropriate online assessment methods with authentication, and provide guidance on online behaviour and plagiarism.

1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

 \Rightarrow Ensure that qualifications obtained online are given the <u>same recognition as traditional</u> <u>qualifications.</u>



CONSIDERATIONS FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE OF E-LEARNING PROVISION

ESTHER HUERTAS, IVAN BISCAN, CHARLOTTE EJSING, LINDSEY KERBER, LIZA KOZLOWSKA, SANDRA MARCOS ORTEGA, LIIA LAURI, MONIKA RISSE, KERSTIN SCHORG, GEORG SEPPMANN



CONSIDERATION FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE OF E-LEARNING

How to adapt the ESG for e-learning provision?

- 1.5 Teaching staff
- \Rightarrow Institutions should provide <u>technological/pedagogical support</u> to teaching staff involved in elearning.

1.6 Learning resources and student support

- ⇒ Ensure sufficient <u>financial resources</u> for robust, secure and accessible virtual learning environments
- 1.7 Information management
- \Rightarrow <u>Collect data specific to online learning for programme evaluation and student support</u>
- 1.8 Public information
- ⇒ Publish <u>clear</u>, accurate, and accessible information about online training, including technical requirements, support, and completion/dropout rates.
- 1.9 Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of programmes
- \Rightarrow <u>Regularly</u> evaluate the effectiveness of the online format





ESTHER HUERTAS, IVAN BISCAN, CHARLOTTE EJSING, LINDSEY KERBER, LIZA KOZLOWSKA, SANDRA MARCOS ORTEGA, LIIA LAURI, MONIKA RISSE, KERSTIN SCHORG, GEORG SEPPMANN



What is your experience with microcredentials in Ukraine?

How useful has it been in supporting academic continuity during the war?

Have you ever taken a microcredential yourself?



SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS

The war can affect partnership opportunities, and monitoring their recovery is important.

Conflict can negatively impact a university's legitimacy through social stigma related to stability, security, and quality, affecting enrollment and partnerships. This needs to be **monitored**.

Three main actors come into play to support the quest for international partnerships in times of war :

Government/Ministry of Higher Education

Support institutions by clarifying legitimacy issues for international partners

Higher Education Institutions

Build connections with the international academic community to support academic staff and students

Assure the quality of its internationalisation

Quality assurance agencies

Support institutions by defining standards and indicators for institutions' internationalisation

One key indicator for international partnerships in times of war: academic solidarity!

EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS – WHAT IS ACADEMIC SOLIDARITY?



🚊 👌 Unesco

Does your QA agency acknowledge academic solidarity as a quality indicator?

Francesc Pedro, UNESCO (2024)

Education 203010

EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS – WHAT IS ACADEMIC SOLIDARITY?

Type of solidarity	Examples of qualitative indicators	Examples of quantitative indicators	
Inter-Institutional Solidarity (university-to-university cooperation)	 Documented cases of mutual support agreements with international partner universities (e.g. shared curricula, online hosting of displaced staff) Use of pre-existing partnerships to enable remote teaching or material transfers 	 Number of active partner universities providing teaching backup, online course hosting, or mobility support Number of displaced students or academics hosted via bilateral agreements, not just international aid Percentage of suspended programmes re- activated through partnerships 	
Civic & Global Engagement (<i>solidarity beyond the</i> <i>university</i>)	 Evidence of university-led humanitarian or psychosocial outreach, especially involving students Activities related to documenting, analysing or mitigating the impact of war on society 	 Number of community-facing solidarity projects (legal aid, mental health, education for children) Percentage of students involved in voluntary, conflict-related civic action or knowledge-sharing 	

EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS

Several remedial actions can be implemented depending on the diagnosis made with quality assurance

Diagnosis

Your former foreign partners no longer wish to support you since the war (poor academic solidarity indicator)

Your former foreign partners are still willing to support you through alternative channels (good academic solidarity indicator) Seek partnership elsewhere, through brokering partnership for example (e.g. Council for At-Risk Academics – Cara)

Remedial actions

Promote formal recognition of qualifications for students and academic who want to go abroad: the Global Convention for the Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications (2019) and the Qualifications Passport are UNESCO initiatives that facilitate the recognition of qualifications, especially for refugees

Adapt your international partnerships to the crisis situation: develop digital infrastructure to facilitate exchanges with your partners through e-learning platforms (MOOCs, blended learning), digital content (open educational resources, digital libraries, virtual labs), and capacity building for educators and administrators.

EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS – EXAMPLE FROM SYRIA

Several remedial actions can be implemented depending on the diagnosis made with quality assurance

Diagnosis

Your former foreign partners no longer wish to support you since the war (poor academic solidarity indicator)



Brokering Partnerships: using brokers, such as the Council for At-Risk Academics (Cara), which can connect HEIs to reputable universities willing to support them in key areas and facilitate professional connections and research collaboration with international colleagues.

Remedial actions

Example: Cara Syria Programme (2016-2024)

- English for academic purposes: weekly online one-to-one tutor sessions, with weekly online group English and Speaking Practice sessions => over 90 participants
- Academic development: seek to address skills and cultural gaps from a research culture to another through foundational courses, weekly training sessions, academic writing workshops
- Research incubation visit in the UK => 29 visits of Syrian researchers in the UK (including some remotely during the pandemic)
- Research grants => over 80 pieces of research developed by nearly 100 Syrian researchers

EVALUATING THE RELEVANCE AND USE OF INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIPS – EXAMPLE FROM MYANMAR

Several remedial actions can be implemented depending on the diagnosis made with quality assurance





Your former foreign partners are still willing to support you through alternative channels (good academic solidarity indicator)

Remedial actions

Adapt your international partnerships to the crisis situation thanks to digital tools

Example of Myanmar and Italy

- 2016: launch of a partnership between the University of Parma and the University of Medicine 1 of Yangon to foster student exchange and joint research
- 2021: military coup in Myanmar severely impacts higher education. The two universities created an online training programme to address urgent medical needs
 - <u>Programme design</u>: educational needs assessment involving 298 surveys and 10 interviews to identify training priorities and develop a four-module e-learning
 - <u>Course delivery</u>: prerecorded high-fidelity telesimulations with multilingual support to ensure accessibility
 - <u>Exams</u>: post-module quizzes

Results: Over 750 students participated, with significant knowledge acquisition observed—60% scored 8 or higher across all modules.

Have for former international partners kept supporting your institution through the war?

Would you like to share examples of international partnerships you experienced (whether successful or disappointing) ?



SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EUROPEAN CONSIDERATIONS

Key aspects of wellbeing according to the European University Association

COMMUNITY AND CULTURE	POLICIES AND PRACTICES	INSTITUTIONAL ATTRIBUTES	
 Psychological safety and a safe learning/working environment A sense of institutional connection and belonging Inclusivity and accessibility Mutual respect between all members of an institution Good studying/working relationships and social connections A shared culture and vision Connection between governance and people Good communication with colleagues and managers 	 Work-life balance Management of workloads Recognition and reward Flexibility in studying working arrangements Support systems and services Contracts and secure working arrangements Co-creation and collaboration High-quality facilities and resources Sustainable management and interaction practices 	 A culture of understanding and empathy Fairness in decisions and actions Transparency in decision-making Diversity and multi- culturalism Supporting individual agency 	<image/> <section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><section-header><text><text><text></text></text></text></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header></section-header>

ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EUROPEAN CONSIDERATIONS

Challenges identified by the European University Association

- Wellbeing is complex
- The environment affecting wellbeing is dynamic
- Responsibility in wellbeing is not anchored in every institutional culture
- Wellbeing required clear and transparent communication



ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EUROPEAN CONSIDERATIONS

Some recommendations by the European University Association:

- As an initial step, student and staff wellbeing should be clearly addressed in an institution's policies and strategies. These policies and strategies need to be clearly communicated to, and implemented by, staff and students alike.
- Institutional leaders should commit to engaging in regular, authentic and open conversations with staff and students at all levels and create robust routes for closing the feedback loop
- Leaders at all levels of the institution should be role-models, leading by example
- Institutions should prioritise investment, infrastructure and resources to create an environment of wellbeing. Leaders should accept that compromises will be necessary to create a wellbeing culture
- Engage students and staff as active and equal agents and partners in wellbeing, providing them with dedicated time to support members of their community.
- Wellbeing needs to be quality assured: Institutions should identify areas for enhancement and ways to embed wellbeing at the heart of their culture. Continuous reflection on this important matter is also encouraged.



ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EXAMPLE FROM ARMENIA

The French University in Armenia noticed that young soldiers face difficulty in returning to their studies.

Diagnosis

 \Rightarrow An internal study reports that more than 55% of young men returning from military service experience difficulties reintegrating into the education system

Remedial action

⇒ Development of a reintegration programme for the students who participated in the 2020 war





ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EXAMPLE FROM ARMENIA

Remedial action

⇒ Development of a **reintegration programme** for the students who participated in the 2020 war

Objective: help student soldiers to resume their studies and catch up with what they had missed once they returned

Actions implemented: Private lessons/tutoring, psychological support and an individual monitoring of student progress

- At first, the university hired an external psychologist but since 2023, it has also recruited an in-house psychologist who offers anonymous psychological counselling services to enrolled students and is easier to access.




USING QUALITY ASSURANCE TO IMPROVE TEACHING AND LEARNING IN EMERGENCY AND CRISIS SITUATIONS

ENSURING STAFF AND STUDENT WELLBEING – EXAMPLE FROM ARMENIA

Impact measured by internal quality assurance:

- A strong start to psychological support: 50 students met with the psychologist within the first 3 months of the programme
- The students say they are generally very satisfied with the additional courses offered
- The students have also suggested adding specialised courses (such as French language courses), and the management team of the University has accepted their proposal





SOME SPECIFIC QUALITY ASSURANCE FOCUS IN TIMES OF EMERGENCY AND CRISIS



POST-CONFLICT QUALITY ASSURANCE – TAKING DISABILITY INTO ACCOUNT



Their study shows that students with disabilities suffer from discrimination and a lack of support and supervision during their studies.

- Conduct research on the situation of students, teachers and researchers with disabilities, and disseminate it
- Adopt an intersectional approach to take into account all types of disability and discrimination
- Encourage the development of communities and associations of students and researchers with disabilities so that they can support each other and exchange ideas
- Have inclusive staff and infrastructure: library access for all, interpreters for events, and adaptation of online teaching for people with disabilities
- Adapt job descriptions for recruitment: inclusive language, identification of a contact person for disability-related questions, details on building accessibility;-
- Involve people with disabilities in decision-making "Nothing about us without us"

POST-CONFLICT QUALITY ASSURANCE – TAKING DISABILITY INTO ACCOUNT

The inclusion of people with disabilities in higher education is a longstanding global challenge. However, in post conflictaffected countries, where disability rates usually surge due to war and repeated crises, this topic requires especially urgent attention.

- Obtaining reliable data and information about disabilities in the conflict circumstances is extremely difficult, but it is expected that the numbers of people with disabilities will have rocketed at the end of the war
- It is important to take into account non-visible disability and students with caring responsibilities (often females)
- ⇒ Measuring students' disability and improving their academic experience is key to avoid dropouts!

Examples of adaptation for disabled students

- Development of an institutional policy after consulting the stakeholders
- More flexibility in the pace of study and exams
- Train teacher in inclusive education
- Tutoring / mentorship
- Ensure physical accessibility to the building
- Peer support group
- Partnership with NGOs

USING QUALITY ASSURANCE TO IMPROVE TEACHING AND LEARNING IN EMERGENCY AND CRISIS SITUATIONS

POST-CONFLICT PEACBUILDING WITH QUALITY ASSURANCE – EXAMPLE FROM KOSOVO

Universities in post-conflict contexts face significant challenges, including damaged infrastructure, displaced populations, and economic hardships.

⇒ However, quality assurance, when tailored to these unique environments, can help address these issues and foster recovery through stabilising, reconstructing, state-building, and peacebuilding efforts.



Diagnosis

Kosovo has undergone significant transformation since the end of the war in 1999 and its declaration of independence in 2008, leading to an intensive expansion of its higher education sector and the proliferation of both public and private HEIs.

- ⇒ This rapid growth presented specific challenges in **developing, regulating, and consolidating the sector**, with the establishment of a quality culture.
- ⇒ Somme **obstacles** stemmed from the past, including the occupation and war from 1989-1999, and the lack of experience due to political and economic transition

USING QUALITY ASSURANCE TO IMPROVE TEACHING AND LEARNING IN EMERGENCY AND CRISIS SITUATIONS

POST-CONFLICT PEACBUILDING WITH QUALITY ASSURANCE – EXAMPLE FROM KOSOVO

Remedial actions

Establishment of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) by the Ministry in 2004

- It is the only agency in Kosovo responsible for the accreditation of HEIs and their study programmes
- It benefitted from international support through capacity building & staff development (US Embassy; Austrian Development Agency; TEMPUS project)
- It contributes to Kosovo's integration into the European Higher Education Area
- ⇒ However, KAA still strives for full compliance with the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG)

Impact of the remedial actions

- Decrease of the number of private HEIs (from 28 to 9) du to the regulation carried out by KAA accreditation activities
- "The KAA is the best that has happened to Kosovo since the war"; "Crucial role in harmonising the system", "Without KAA we would not have been where we are now" [quotes from ENQA review of KAA in 2014]
- KAA is registered in the European Quality Assurance
 Register for Higher Education (EQAR) = ESG-compliant



What role do you see for higher education and quality assurance in the reconstruction of Ukraine?

What would you need to successfully support the reconstruction?



DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- 16:00-16:30 Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- 11:00-11:15 Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- **16:00-16:30** Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- 11:15-11:50 Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

WORKSHOP

How to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war in Ukraine?

The aim of the **peer-learning workshop** is to provide you with an opportunity to share your experiences of quality assurance of teaching and learning in emergency and crisis situations, and to learn from other participants.

⇒ The document is divided into five main sections, each corresponding to one of the five areas of enhancement and quality assurance focus studied today. You are therefore invited to complete the table by providing examples of quality assurance and enhancement procedures that you have implemented or wish to develop.

2) Area of enhancement : Teaching delivery mode

⇒ If you would like to provide feedback on enhancement areas not discussed during the training session, you can do so in the sixth section of the document.

This document will then be saved and sent to all participants to serve as a database of good practices.

Current situation/issue encountered	Quality assurance mechanisms used for diagnosis and continuous enhancement	Expected outcome of the quality assurance mechanism	Timeframe for implementation	Challenge in implementation



https://docs.google.com/document/d/1 pRVpZXysCUxeP5tCPUitLGcVez1rEQHcCx bxTB0ksJE/edit?tab=t.0



DAY 1

- **14:30-14:45** Opening session
- **14:45-15:00** Introduction to the technical assistance mission
- **15:00-16:00** Key concepts and tools for the quality assurance of teaching and learning



- **16:00-16:30** Health break
- 16:30-17:25 Roundtable with the Ukrainian higher education reform experts (HERE team)
- 17:25-17:30 Wrap-up and close of the day

DAY 2

- 09:30-11:00 Quality assurance to enhance teaching & learning in emergency and crisis situations
- **11:00-11:15** Health break
- **11:15-11:50** Workshop: how to set up efficient quality assurance systems adapted to war and post-war situations in Ukraine?
- **11:50-12:00** Wrap-up and close of the technical assistance mission

WRAP-UP | KEY TAKE AWAYS

Aspect of teaching and learning	Interesting feature for emergency and crisis situations	Examples of quality assurance indicators or procedure
Student progression	 Student progression and success 	Cohort analysis
Teaching delivery mode	MicrocredentialsOnline learning	 Institutional- or programme-approach to quality assurance of microcredentials Quality assurance tailored to online learning
Student and staff wellbeing	 Psychological unit, reintegration programme, remedial courses 	 Student satisfaction survey Quantitative indicators on the number of students following a reintegatration programme and their retention rate
International partnership	 Academic solidarity Brokering partnerships Online academic partnerships 	 Evidence of university-led humanitarian or psychosocial outreach, especially involving students Impact of partnership Course evaluations
Post-conflict phase	 Inclusivity and disabilty Peacebuilding and reconstruction 	 Quality assurance processes and indicators cognisant of disability National reconstruction policy including national quality assurance policy

WRAP-UP | POST-TRAINING SURVEY

https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIp QLSdEU4VPn5xsGIcTpu E7H9-MDejftc q6VqW96JHY7kz7dJCQ/viewform ?usp=header



Any questions or comments?

